## **EXHIBIT D**

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF ARKANSAS FAYETTEVILLE DIVISION

JILL DILLARD, JESSA SEEWALD,

**PLAINTIFFS** 

JINGER VUOLO, and JOY DUGGAR

V. CASE NO. 5:17-CV-05089-TLB

CITY OF SPRINGDALE, ARKANSAS;

**DEFENDANTS** 

WASHINGTON COUNTY, ARKANSAS;

KATHY O'KELLEY, in her individual and official capacities;

ERNEST CATE, in his individual and official capacities; RICK HOYT, in his individual and official capacities; STEVE ZEGA, in his official capacity; DOES 1-10, inclusive

\_\_\_\_\_

## ORAL VIDEOCONFERENCE AND VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF JOY ANNA DUGGAR FORSYTH AUGUST 30, 2021

\_\_\_\_\_

ORAL VIDEOCONFERENCE AND VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION of JOY ANNA DUGGAR FORSYTH, produced as a witness at the instance of the Defendants, and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered cause on the 30th day of August, 2021, from 10:01 a.m. to 3:38 p.m., before Natanya Riddle, CCR in and for the State of Arkansas, reported by machine shorthand method in Fayetteville, Arkansas (virtually), pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the provisions stated on the record.



```
APPEARANCES
 1
 2
    FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
       Mr. Steven E. Bledsoe - Via Videoconference
       Ms. Nicole J. Kim - Via Videoconference
 3
        LARSON, LLP
 4
        555 South Flower Street, Suite 4400
        Los Angeles, CA 90071
 5
       PHONE: (949)516-7262
        E-mail: Sbledsoe@larsonllp.com
 6
         -and-
 7
       Mr. Shawn Daniels - Via Videoconference
       HARE, WYNN, NEWELL & NEWTON, LLP
 8
        129 West Sunbridge Drive
 9
        Fayetteville, Arkansas 72703
        PHONE: (479)521-7000
10
       E-mail: Shawn@hwnn.com
11
    FOR THE DEFENDANTS WASHINGTON COUNTY, ARKANSAS; RICK
    HOYT, in his individual and official capacities; and
     STEVE ZEGA, in his official capacity:
12
       Mr. Jason Owens - Via Videoconference
13
        JASON OWENS LAW FIRM, P.A.
        1023 Main Street, Suite 204
14
        Conway, Arkansas 72033
        PHONE: (501)764-4334
15
       E-mail:
                Owens@jowenslawfirm.com
     FOR THE DEFENDANTS CITY OF SPRINGDALE, ARKANSAS; KATHY
16
     O'KELLEY, in her individual and official capacities; and
17
     ERNEST CATE, in his individual and official capacities:
       Mr. Thomas N. Kieklak - Via Videoconference
       Mr. R. Justin Eichmann - Via Videoconference
18
       HARRINGTON, MILLER, KIEKLAK, EICHMANN AND BROWN, P.A.
19
        4710 South Thompson, Suite 102
        Springdale, Arkansas 72764
20
        PHONE: (479)751-6464
        E-mail:
               Tkieklak@arkansaslaw.com
21
         - and -
22
         Ms. Susan Keller Kendall - Via Videoconference
23
         KENDALL LAW FIRM, PLLC
         3706 Pinnacle Hills Parkway, Suite 201
24
         Rogers, Arkansas 72758
         PHONE: (479)464-9828
25
         E-mail:
                 Skk@kendalllawfirm.com
```



```
1
     THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
        Ms. Julie Coulston - Via Videoconference
        ARKANSAS REALTIME REPORTING
 2
        1130 East Millsap Road
 3
        Fayetteville, Arkansas 72703
        PHONE: (479)301-2040
        E-mail: Support@arkansasrealtimereporting.com
 4
 5
     ALSO PRESENT:
        Ms. Kathy O'Kelley - Via Videoconference
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```



that up was that it felt like there was more paparazzi 1 after these disclosures. Is that fair? 2 3 Α. Yes. Ο. Okay. 5 Yeah, we -- I mean, day-to-day life, there's not 6 paparazzi ever. 7 Where does your relationship with Josh stand as we 8 sit here today? 9 Could you be, I quess, more specific than that? 10 Sure. When was the last time you saw Josh? Ο. 11 It would have been probably three or four months 12 ago. Okay. Why didn't you sue Josh in this lawsuit? 13 Q. 14 MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form. 15 Joy, you don't need to answer that 16 question. 17 THE WITNESS: Okay. MR. OWENS: I'm going to ask the court 18 19 reporter to certify that question. 20 What's your basis, Steve, for instructing 21 your client not to answer the question? 22 MR. BLEDSOE: Attorney work product, 23 attorney-client privilege. 24 MR. OWENS: Okay. 25 (BY MR. OWENS) Let me just preface the remainder of Ο.

my questions with -- with these statements: None of my 1 2 questions are intended to inquire about any 3 conversations you've had with any of your lawyers. Okay? Do you understand that? 4 5 Yeah. Α. Okay. Have you ever considered suing your brother? 6 Ο. 7 No. Α. 8 Ο. Why not? 9 MR. BLEDSOE: And, Joy, I'm going to 10 instruct you not to answer to the extent any 11 discussion or anything you state relates to a 12 discussion that you've had with any of the 13 lawyers on this case or among your sisters 14 after discussing the matter with lawyers. 15 THE WITNESS: Okav. 16 MR. BLEDSOE: Based on what the lawyers 17 have discussed. 18 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Okay. 19 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) You may answer. I -- I don't know what to say, I guess. I don't 20 21 know. 22 It's just never been something that you've considered, right? 23 Yeah. 24 Α. 25 Have you forgiven Josh?

1	A. Yeah.
1	
2	Q. Why?
3	MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
4	A. I think forgiving and trusting are two completely
5	different things; and I have forgiven him so that I feel
6	like if I become bitter over it, then that's going to
7	make my life worse. It's not going to do anything for
8	me. And but I think forgiving and trusting are
9	different things and, yes, I've forgiven him for what
10	he's done to me, but I don't trust him.
11	Q. (BY MR. OWENS) Gotcha.
12	You mentioned these negative comments on
13	the Internet directed at you and your family on various
14	levels.
15	Have you ever received any messages of
16	support from any source?
17	A. People supporting me?
18	Q. Yes.
19	A. Yes.
20	Q. Lots of them, right?
21	MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
22	A. A good amount.
23	Q. (BY MR. OWENS) People from all over the country and
24	the world message you to tell you they're praying for
25	you and they stand with you and those kinds of things,

- 1 | because they were the only two that were married?
- 2 A. Yeah. Yeah.
- 3 | Q. Wasn't Josh married?
- 4 A. Yes, but he was not involved anymore.
- 5 Q. Okay. Do you think that the fact of a child sexual
- 6 offense is of legitimate public concern?
- 7 MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
- 8 A. Can you restate that?
- 9 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) Sure.
- 10 Do you think the public should be
- 11 | concerned about sex offenses against minors?
- MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
- 13 | A. Yes.
- 14 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) The public is concerned about sex
- offenses against minors, aren't they?
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 Q. In what ways have you sought solitude or seclusion
- 18 | in your life?
- MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
- 20 A. Do you mean, like, finding ways to, like, relax and
- 21 | stuff? Or what --
- 22 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) Well -- so you've been on TV for
- 23 most of your life. That seems to me to not be a very
- 24 | secluded life or a life of solitude.
- Have you ever sought solitude or



- 1 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) You may answer.
- 2 | A. Oh, okay. "Physical" as being, like, bodily or,
- 3 | like, monetarily or...
- 4 Q. Well, let's take them in turn.
- 5 How about bodily first?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 | Q. How about monetarily?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
- 10 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) What monetary injuries have you
- 11 | suffered as a result of these disclosures?
- 12 A. Uncounted number of -- I do advertising online and
- 13 | I have lost multiple deals because of it, being a
- 14 | majority of them, actually.
- 15 Q. Okay. So I asked you before if you worked outside
- 16 the home and you -- you told me no, and that's because
- 17 | you work inside the home?
- 18 A. Yes, I guess, yeah. I work from home.
- 19 Q. That's okay. So what do you do for income?
- 20 A. I do advertising on -- online.
- 21 Q. How does that work? I've always been a little bit
- 22 curious about that. How does that work?
- 23 A. I have companies -- either I reach out to companies
- or they reach out to me and -- to promote different
- 25 products.



- 1 Q. What kinds of products?
- 2 A. Could be beauty, could be, you know, baby stuff,
- 3 home supplies, electronics, pretty much anything.
- 4 | Q. And what's your role in marketing or promoting
- 5 | those products?
- 6 A. I normally take pictures and post them with, like,
- 7 links for people to -- to use to get, you know, a
- 8 discount.
- 9 Q. Okay. Okay.
- 10 AUTOMATED MESSAGE: It's 12:00 o'clock.
- 11 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) How long have you been doing that?
- 12 A. I've been doing that since I was -- I think I was
- 13 | almost 18.
- 14 Q. Okay. So any other sources of income for you
- 15 personally?
- 16 | A. Nothing huge, I guess, no. I do some YouTube
- 17 videos just on, like, DIY projects or family life, but
- 18 other than that, no.
- 19 Q. And my understanding is -- because I've never done
- 20 | this. My understanding is that YouTube pays based on
- 21 | the number of views. If you have a really large number
- 22 of views, they pay you some amount, right?
- 23 A. Yeah, depending on if you have ads on there or not.
- 24 Q. I see. Okay.
- What was your income for 2020, just



- 1 ballpark?
- 2 A. Just for me?
- 3 Q. Yeah.
- 4 A. It was probably around 40,000.
- 5 Q. Okay. Your -- how did that compare to the years
- 6 | before that?
- 7 MR. BLEDSOE: Object to the form.
- 8 Q. (BY MR. OWENS) Has it built up over time?
- 9 A. Pardon?
- 10 Q. Has that built up over time?
- 11 A. Because I've been proactive in it, it has. But
- 12 | it's also really hard to get new people to do
- advertisings with me. Or they'll -- they'll start and
- 14 | then they'll cut it off.
- 15 Q. Okay. Okay. Your husband works as well?
- 16 | A. Yes, sir.
- 17 Q. What does he do?
- 18 A. He's a commercial contractor.
- 19 Q. Oh, okay. There in Northwest Arkansas?
- 20 A. Yes, sir.
- 21 Q. Okay. What's the name of his company?
- 22 A. Red Oak Homes. He builds new homes right now.
- 23 Q. Oh, I see. Okay. Residential construction?
- 24 A. Yes, sir.
- 25 Q. Okay.



## 1 COURT REPORTER CERTIFICATION 2 3 I, NATANYA RIDDLE, Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of Arkansas, do 4 5 hereby certify that prior to the commencement of the 6 examination, JOY ANNA DUGGAR FORSYTH was duly sworn by 7 me to testify to the truth, the whole truth, and nothing 8 but the truth. 9 I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that the foregoing is 10 a verbatim transcript of the testimony as taken 11 stenographically by and before me at the time, place, 12 and on the date hereinbefore set forth, to the best of 13 my ability. 14 I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither a 15 relative, nor employee, nor attorney to any of the 16 parties in this action, and that I am neither a 17 relative, nor employee of such attorney or counsel, and 18 that I am not financially interested in the action. 19 20 natanya Giddle 21 22 NATANYA RIDDLE, CCR, RPR 23 LS Certificate #766, State of Arkansas 24 Notary Public in and for the State of Arkansas 25 Dated: September 16, 2021